

Sophie Froelich SBN 213194
NOSSAMAN, LLP
50 California Street, 34th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Phone: (415) 398-3600
Fax: (415) 398-2438
sfroelich@nossaman.com
Specially Appearing for Defendant
South Coast Winery, Inc.

David L. Hoffman SBN: 143474
LAW OFFICES OF DAVID L. HOFFMAN
28494 Westinghouse Place, Suite 204
Valencia, CA 91355
Phone: (661) 775-0300
Fax: (661) 775-9423
Of Counsel for Defendant
South Coast Winery, Inc.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

Mark Carter, an individual, and Christy Carter,
an individual,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

South Coast Winery, Inc.

Defendant.

CASE NO. C08-02979 (EMC) ADR

**DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS,
STAY OR TRANSFER UNDER THE
FIRST-TO-FILE RULE AND F.R.C.P.
12(b)(3) & MEMO OF POINTS &
AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT**

**Date: August 27, 2008
Time: 10:30 a.m.
Courtroom: C, 15th Floor
Judge: Hon. Edward M. Chen**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT at 10:30 a.m. on Wednesday, August 27, 2008, or as soon thereafter as counsel may be heard, in Courtroom C, the courtroom of the Honorable Edward M. Chen located at 450 Golden Gate Avenue, San Francisco, CA will move for an order either dismissing, staying or transferring the instant action under the "First To File" rule and Fed. R. Civ. Proc. 12(b)(3).

1 This motion will be made on the grounds that defendant South Coast Winery, Inc. filed an
2 action in the Central District of California entitled South Coast Winery, Inc. v. Mark Carter &
3 Christy Carter, Case No. CV-08-03269 CAS (RCx) on or about May 11, 2008. That action is
4 pending before the Honorable Christina A. Snyder, Courtroom #5 located at 312 N. Spring Street,
5 Los Angeles, CA 90012.

6 In response to South Coast Winery's ("SCW's") complaint, on or about June 20, 2008, the
7 plaintiffs in this action filed an answer and counterclaim. The counterclaim asserted four
8 virtually identical claims to the claims raised by Carter Cellars (Mark and Christy Carter) in this
9 action. SCW's action was filed first and there is an identity of both parties, issues and causes of
10 action in both matters such that the "first to file rule" should be invoked without exception.
11

12 The instant application will be based on this Notice of Motion and Motion, the attached
13 Memorandum of Points and Authorities, and the declaration of David L. Hoffman accompanying
14 this notice of motion and motion.
15

16 Dated: July 21, 2008

NOSSAMAN LLP

17 By: _____/S/
18 Sophie Froelich, Esq.